

CITY OF CHARLEVOIX
REGULAR CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES
Monday, July 6, 2015 – 7:00 p.m.
210 State Street, City Hall, Council Chambers, Charlevoix, MI

The meeting was called to order at 7:00 p.m. by Mayor Gabe Campbell.

I. Pledge of Allegiance

II. Roll Call of Members Present

Mayor: Gabe Campbell
Interim City Manager: Mike Spencer
City Clerk: Joyce Golding
City Attorney: Scott Howard
Members Present: Councilmembers Shane Cole, Shirley Gibson, Luther Kurtz, Leon Perron, Jeff Porter, Bill Supernaw
Absent: None

III. Inquiry Regarding Possible Conflicts of Interest

Councilmember Kurtz stated that he would recuse himself from agenda item D: Airport Manager Qualifications and Documentation of Changes Implemented at the Charlevoix Municipal Airport.

Councilmember Supernaw questioned the origins of the need for agenda item III: Inquiry Regarding Possible Conflicts of Interest. City Attorney Howard stated this item was likely added by a previous Council and was quite typical of most municipalities. Having this agenda item allows for any possible recusals in advance of regular agenda topics. City Attorney Howard noted that if there is a disagreement to whether there is a possible conflict of interest, the appropriate course of action is for Council to discuss and try to come to an agreement. If there is not a consensus, then Council should vote on the matter with a majority required.

IV. Consent Agenda

The following items were approved and filed:

- A. Approval of Minutes – June 15, 2015 Regular Meeting Minutes
- B. Special Accounts Payable Check Register – June 11, 2015
- C. Special Accounts Payable Check Register – June 12, 2015
- D. Special Accounts Payable Check Register – June 22, 2015
- E. Special Accounts Payable Check Register – July 1, 2015
- F. Regular Accounts Payable Check Register – July 7, 2015
- G. ACH Payments – June 15, 2015 – July 6, 2015
- H. Payroll Check Register – June 19, 2015
- I. Payroll Transmittal – June 19, 2015
- J. Payroll Check Register – July 2, 2015
- K. Payroll Transmittal – July 2, 2015

V. Public Hearings

None.

VI. Reports

Interim City Manager Spencer stated that the Lake to Lake Trail is officially open to the public after a twenty year process. Seventy percent of the \$580,000 raised for the trail was obtained through grant funding. Additional donations will be used toward landscaping, benches and future trail work and can be made through the Charlevoix County Community Foundation: "Charlevoix Lake to Lake Multi-use Trail Fund".

Interim City Manager Spencer indicated that the State Street project paving is scheduled to begin on July 17 creating at least a two week delay. He will contact the contractor and report back to Council the reason for the delay. It was noted that the original completion date was July 1 and there is a penalty clause for late completion.

Interim City Manager Spencer referred to the Proposed Street Improvement map that was created by DPW Superintendent Elliott and the engineers regarding a proactive approach to alleviating water main breaks within the City. Interim City Manager Spencer will address this topic in more detail at the July 20th Council meeting.

One locust tree will be removed in front of the County building which is causing the sidewalk to heave creating a safety concern.

VII. Requests, Petitions and Communications and Actions Thereon

A. Charlevoix Venetian Festival

1. Consideration of Venetian Festival Funding Contract

Dan Barron, President of Charlevoix Venetian Festival, reviewed the 2015 Venetian Festival planned activities and submitted a proposed contract for Council's consideration asking for a \$15,000 donation.

Mayor Campbell opened the item to public comment. There was no comment, and the item was closed.

Motion by Councilmember Supernaw, second by Councilmember Gibson, to authorize the Mayor to sign the 2015 Funding Contract for the Venetian Festival.

Yeas: Porter, Kurtz, Perron, Gibson, Cole, Supernaw
Nays: None
Absent: None

2. Venetian Festival Fireworks Permit

The Venetian Committee is requesting permission for a fireworks display on July 24th and July 25th. Chief Doan reviewed the permits and there are no changes from 2014 in the setup and size of the display for either night. The proposed fireworks display by Colonial Fireworks meets all NFPA requirements and exceeds the NFPA standard for minimum setbacks for both shows. Chief Doan recommended that the permit be authorized noting that the Police Department will take an aggressive stance to stop the display if drifting debris or other unforeseen issues arise that may compromise safety.

Mayor Campbell opened the item to public comment. There was no comment, and the item was closed.

Motion by Councilmember Perron, second by Councilmember Kurtz, to authorize the City Clerk to issue the fireworks permit for the 2015 Venetian Festival fireworks displays.

Yeas: Porter, Kurtz, Perron, Gibson, Cole, Supernaw
Nays: None
Absent: None

Motion by Councilmember Cole, second by Councilmember Supernaw, to authorize the Mayor to sign the Hold Harmless agreement with Colonial Fireworks Company.

Yeas: Porter, Kurtz, Perron, Gibson, Cole, Supernaw
Nays: None
Absent: None

3. Consideration of Charlevoix Venetian Festival's Tiki Tent

The Charlevoix Venetian Festival wishes to erect a Tiki Tent with all proceeds benefitting the Venetian Festival. The tent will be located at the north end of East Park and will be open Tuesday through Saturday 6pm-11pm offering beverages and entertainment.

The City of Charlevoix City Code, Title III, Chapter 31, Section 3.14 states:

It shall be unlawful for any person to consume alcoholic beverages in any part of any park which lies within one thousand (1,000) feet of US Highway 31, except that such restriction does not extend to privately owned vessels moored in the yacht basin nor does it extend to any specific function authorized by the city manager...

Mayor Campbell opened the item to public comment. There was no comment, and the item was closed.

Motion by Councilmember Cole, second by Councilmember Kurtz, to authorize the Interim City Manager to waive the alcohol restrictions as outlined in the City of Charlevoix City Code, Title III, Chapter 31, Section 3.14 for the Venetian Festival Tiki Tent.

Yeas: Porter, Kurtz, Perron, Gibson, Cole, Supernaw
Nays: None
Absent: None

B. Request by Charlevoix Yacht Club for Free Parking – Nucore Triangle and Red Fox Regatta

The Charlevoix Yacht Club would like City Council to consider waiving parking fees at Ferry Beach Boat Launch for the Nucore Triangle on September 4, 2015 and the Red Fox Regatta on September 5–6, 2015.

Per the City Code, Title X, Chapter 148, Section 10.84:

The city council, by resolution, may revise or waive fees for special or public events. The term "special or public events" shall mean a tournament, festival or other type of event, whether or not open to public participation or observation, the occurrence of which will, in the judgment of the city council, benefit the city economically or by virtue of the publicity surrounding the event.

Mayor Campbell opened the item to public comment. There was no comment, and the item was closed.

Action by Resolution.

C. Consideration of Approval for Jefferson Beach Yacht Sales Rendezvous July 31 – August 2, 2015

Jefferson Beach Yacht Sales (JBYS), a downtown Charlevoix business, wishes to host a boat rendezvous at the Charlevoix City Marina July 31 – August 2, 2015 for approximately 25 boats. JBYS is proposing a tent in Bridge Park for meals and is requesting to serve alcohol during their evening activities. Executive Assistant Weller indicated that this private event with a cash bar is permitted in Bridge Park and insurance was reviewed by the City Treasurer.

The City of Charlevoix City Code, Title III, Chapter 31, Section 3.14 states:

It shall be unlawful for any person to consume alcoholic beverages in any part of any park which lies within one thousand (1,000) feet of US Highway 31, except that such restriction does not extend to privately owned vessels moored in the yacht basin nor does it extend to any specific function authorized by the city manager...

Mayor Campbell opened the item to public comment. There was no comment, and the item was closed.

Motion by Councilmember Gibson, second by Councilmember Perron, to authorize the Interim City Manager to waive the alcohol restrictions as outlined in the City of Charlevoix City Code, Title III, Chapter 31, Section 3.14 for the Jefferson Beach Yacht Sales Rendezvous.

Yeas: Porter, Kurtz, Perron, Gibson, Cole, Supernaw
Nays: None
Absent: None

D. Airport Manager Qualifications and Documentation of Changes Implemented at the Charlevoix Municipal Airport

The following is a verbatim transcript of this agenda item, per Mayor Campbell's request.

Mayor Campbell: "Airport Manager Qualifications and Documentation of Changes Implemented at the Charlevoix Municipal Airport."

Airport Manager Myer: "Good evening, before I begin Luther Kurtz would like to make a statement about his parachuting companies."

Councilmember Kurtz: "Thanks, Liz. Good evening, Council, Mr. Mayor. I just wanted to make a couple of comments about my skydiving business at the airport. There's been a lot of things circulating around about it. First of all I'd just like to get it out there that yes; my comprehensive general liability insurance policy specifically excludes people that are participating in the parachute jump after they have departed the airport. That's the national standard for every skydiving company in the country. I'll discuss a little bit more about that later. What I want to talk about is why I came to Charlevoix with the parachuting company, the history of my interaction with the airport regarding skydiving, some of the complaints that I read on my email over the last few days, specifically in the last few weeks since the last Council meeting, FAA guidance regarding skydiving and airports and then the insurance standards of the skydiving industry.

So, why I came to Charlevoix with skydiving, really it's I love this community and I want to operate a business here that I'm passionate about. You know skydiving and movies are the same deal. When you do a good job for the people they are really excited and really happy and I'm blessed to have two businesses that I can give people a service like that where they're really excited about it. In 2013 Bethany Pearson, unsolicited, invited me to bring my skydiving business and my call center that I use to operate all our skydiving businesses around the country to the City of Charlevoix, that's about 18 jobs. I said I would do it if I could land at the Charlevoix Airport which is like most other skydiving centers around the country. I met with, early 2014, I met with Scott Woody. Scott was very helpful to me to work out a plan to operate that business. He required me to put the City of Charlevoix in our release of liability waiver and my understanding from Scott and other Staff was that everyone liked our operation and that they didn't have any issues with it last summer. So in 2015 I approached Liz, the new Airport Manager here, if we could do the same thing again. And Liz in my opinion loved the operation but she wanted to make sure everything was done correctly. So she required me to fill out a license application and she required me to pay a \$2,500 license fee that is in the minimum, well I don't know if it's in the minimum standards, but it's in somewhere that skydivers have to pay a \$2,500 license fee to Charlevoix. So just on a side note I object to this fee for parachuting at Charlevoix. I've polled all the other skydiving centers in the state of Michigan since really in the last couple of weeks, since this kind of issues have come up regarding my business. And only one other skydiving center in Michigan has to pay a license fee and their license fee is \$200. So I would ask that Council consider reducing that fee actually. I was required to show proof of comprehensive general liability policy which I did. It does have a specific exclusion of the people participating in the parachute jump and she asked to me to show that I included the City of Charlevoix in my release of liability waiver. So just to recap, last year I paid about a \$1,000 in jump costs and stuff like that at the airport with no proof of insurance. This year Liz was hired and she required me to pay \$2,500 and name the City on my comprehensive general liability insurance policy.

After improving the City's position extensively from last year it all of a sudden seems that there's a problem with my operation. In my opinion, Liz did a great job enforcing this. You know this year I've spent \$25,000 in advertising statewide. I advertise in Grand Rapids, Lansing, Detroit, Sault Ste. Marie, and in Traverse City to try to bring people up here to go skydiving. So my customers are a little bit different, people that want to go skydiving around the country, I know. I reach out to them and bring them to Charlevoix. You might notice that I don't do any advertising in Charlevoix except for at the theatre where I play some nice skydiving videos for

people to enjoy. I advertise outside the City to bring people here so I feel that's a great value to the City. The Staff has indicated that there were no complaints about our operation, people have had positive comments about it. I've served several happy customers so far this summer and I received a lot of comments from people in the community that love watching the parachutes land in there from downtown. You know there's been a couple of disappointing complaints about our operation. There was an email just today from Island Airways. You know it's a long email and it was in your packet, but I will say that I've reached out to Island Airways a few times this summer to try to approach them about developing procedures and my understanding was that we were working towards that goal. I'm surprised by the email that was sent. One thing at the end, I'll just read, it says 'Liz, I appreciate your hard work in keeping the construction project well organized and minimally interruptive to our operation. We understand that a change in drop location may have something to do with the construction but the construction is now complete.' I don't know if the construction is complete or not, but they immediately addressed the safety concerns regarding that and I would say we would be open to moving back to the spot that we were at before the construction started. So I don't know if that resolves the issue. I haven't had the chance to fully talk about this email with Island Airways since it just was sent today but, I did talk to the General Manager and she didn't even know that this letter was written. So I don't know exactly how that came about. But, you know it does feel from here a little bit like a personal attack. Now I know that we don't want that on this Council to personally attack each other but, I'm just saying it feels a little bit like that."

Campbell: "Okay I kind of object to that. I don't think that there's a personal attack. I personally think pretty highly of you and maybe I might put it on my bucket list to try that some time."

Kurtz: "Thank you, Mr. Mayor."

Campbell: "But there is a serious problem at the airport and Island Airways had a gentleman's complaint and you're a pilot, I'm not, but if you're bringing a jet in doing 100 miles an hour."

Kurtz: "Hopefully a little more."

Campbell: "And they couldn't find where the guys were that were parachuting. And so I checked at Harbor Springs and you could land and take off but you couldn't drop there. Is that correct?"

Kurtz: "That's true. I offered to not land on the airport in Harbor Springs and that was when I started 13 years ago or 14 years ago maybe, and wasn't as familiar with skydiving as I am now."

Campbell: "Well. It looks like it's a dangerous thing to me because if the pilots don't know where the parachutists are. I worry about the guy in the parachute too."

Kurtz: "Thank you, Mr. Mayor."

Campbell: "A bird can bring a plane down, so. How many, what does it say in here? There was 300 arrivals and departures. So they were coming in pretty regular, leaving pretty regular and I think that that's pretty scary and they didn't know where the jumpers were. So you know that maybe you could do the same thing like you did in Harbor, land and take off and drop someplace else so that you wouldn't be right in the line of fire. Have you thought of that or?"

Kurtz: "No. I do plan to address landing on the airport a little bit later, but I can address your comment there. My goal was to land on the airport here and that is what I agreed to when I agreed to move here. And you know the FAA says that most parachute landing areas are on the airport. And so I'm gonna discuss the guidance by the FAA a little bit farther down if you don't mind. I'll address that at that time in my presentation."

Campbell: "Well you must agree that it's pretty scary having people jumping out of planes with a parachute when you got planes coming and going."

Kurtz: "You know the FAA says that the primary means of separation is visual, meaning that both the parachutists and the pilot have a responsibility to see and avoid each other. Parachutes are steerable just like airplanes are, and they both have an obligation to see and avoid."

Campbell: "Well it looks to me like we should either stop the planes from landing and taking off or stop the parachutes."

Kurtz: "You know, Mr. Mayor, I could see how that might look but, I don't make up the stuff. I go from the FAA and the USPA, United States Parachute Association, guidance and so that's what I look at when I'm trying to figure out what to do regarding skydiving and to do regarding flying. So and that's what I'm doing in this case."

Campbell: "Well I appreciate that but 18 years ago this July 26th we had a tragedy here and two days later the City Manager knocked on my door and said we got a problem. And I said besides the fireworks, oh it relates to that, we don't have any insurance. Okay, so at that time the Council we had to go within a 90-day period until after the Council. I don't know what it is today, but they were so, they were so busy going after the City and they didn't do very good. But they let that go by and then the judge waived that

and they were back over after the Council. Now they only talked to one person and that was Butch Russell but he had, he was in there for I think he told me two hours and there were seven attorneys questioning him and he must have told them the right thing because they didn't come knocking on my door, but like I spent about two or three months wondering. I don't have a hell of a lot but everything I got I earned and I thought that we weren't going to be living in that home. Luckily we only had one child left in the house but I still had my wife and they can just clean you out. And they don't if they, there wasn't enough money for them to go after. But I if they have a problem at that airport and either a parachutist is killed or a plane crashes they are going to come after the City big time and they're gonna come after the Council and they're gonna come after Mike or anybody they can come after. And they won't be coming after me because you'll meet your new Mayor because I'm not going to put my house up for grabs again. I spent many a restless night, Bob Timms was on the Council, Linda was working here, Gerard was working here as a police officer, there's nobody else in here, Dan Barron was working at the thing. Everybody's new and maybe some of them can say oh that's not a big deal I'll get another house. Well I'm 82 and I don't want to start building and trying to get another house so I'm all for you taking off and landing but I don't want any parachutes in there. I do like watching them go down."

Kurtz: "Thank you, Mr. Mayor. Mr. Mayor do you have any even one example of a parachuting incident where a City was?"

Campbell: "Right here. They couldn't find where the parachutes were."

Kurtz: "They couldn't find where the what? So you have an example where the City was?"

Campbell: "And they could only find one, then they found the second one. Is there anybody here from Island Airways?"

Angela LeFevre-Welke, President Island Airways: "I'm here."

Campbell: "Would you like to come up?"

Welke: "I put everything in the complaint and I just wanted to bring this to everyone's attention. There were a tremendous number of planes there and all of my pilots need to be in the course of those three days, so I need to share that. I too, follow the FAA regs."

Councilmember Cole: "Can you have her come up front, Mr. Mayor?"

Kurtz: "Can I finish what I'm doing here, then she can come up?"

Campbell: "He should be able to finish his statement."

Kurtz: "Thank you. Mr. Mayor my question is do you have an example of a City that has been sued because of a skydiving incident and found to be guilty?"

Campbell: "No, but I have an example of a City that had been sued because of a firework."

Kurtz: "I understand that you are trying to sensationalize my business by relating it to the skydiving, I just a (voices talking over each other) relating it to a firework incident."

Campbell: "I want you to succeed in your business. I just don't want you putting the City at risk, that's all I want."

Kurtz: "Okay, thank you, Mr. Mayor."

Cole: "Can we ask some questions?"

Campbell: "Go ahead, Shane."

Councilmember Supernaw: "Mr. Mayor you said that we could have either skydiving or Island Airways. You didn't mean it that way, did you?"

Campbell: "Well I mean, I mean, (voices talking over each other) what I meant was that if you can't guarantee that the planes can land and take off I wouldn't."

Supernaw: "I didn't read that, this, did you get this Ms. City Clerk? There's a date stamp, but no time stamp. What time did this come in?"

Clerk Golding: "I received that from Linda Weller."

Supernaw: "I'm a little suspicious of it coming in at a late hour. Linda, do you remember what time it came in today, this is events that happened apparently on last Thursday."

Campbell: "Just read what it says."

Supernaw: "I did read it and I'm suspicious and I'd would like Mr. Kurtz to explain if his pilot lost two jumpers, if, I don't even know if this is accurate. I have copies and emails in here with falsehoods on other subjects that we'll be talking about before the night's over. I don't know if this, does this sound accurate?"

Campbell: "Can you point out the falsehoods in here?"

Supernaw: "I don't know if it's false or not but that's why I'd like Mr. Kurtz to explain if two, three people jumped out of a plane and two of the parachuters couldn't be found. Where'd they go?"

Kurtz: "Down, I think they're going down. I, Councilman Supernaw, one thing is that a pilot that drops the parachuters is not responsible to keep a visual on all the parachuters that are in the air so the pilot is flying the plane that drops them is responsible to keep a visual on what he is flying toward to see and be seen is the responsibility of his and it's the responsibility of all the other aircraft that come into the airport. Go ahead."

Supernaw: "My, my inference from this letter is the jump plane dropped three jumpers but could only find one jumper while that pilot was turning base to final for runway 27. It sounds like, oh my god there's a parachutist right in front of me. And that's why I need that Island Airways representative to come up here and I want to ask if he is in the flight line or the landing pattern."

Welke: "There could have been a parachutist. My pilot could not see the parachutes, he talked to Luther's pilot and neither of them could see them at the time both planes were in the air."

Campbell: "Would you please come up to the podium? Thank you."

Supernaw: "Nothing happened?"

Welke: "No. Have you ever had an accident or a fatal accident in any of your operations?"

Kurtz: "No."

Supernaw: "This is a."

Welke: "I'm here."

Supernaw: "Yeah, I don't want to monopolize all the time, but."

Welke: "Okay."

Supernaw: "Yes, I am, nobody else seems to want to ask questions. Nothing happened?"

Welke: "No, but it could have."

Supernaw: "I know."

Welke: "Okay."

Supernaw: "The air conditioning might come on in here too but I doubt it. So, I treat you with respect and Island Airways. I do business with you people. Don't know, do I have a conflict, Mr. Attorney? I fly to the island occasionally, but this is hyperbole."

Welke: "Okay, we felt it needed to be brought to your attention and we've done that."

Supernaw: "Earlier than this afternoon would have been nice."

Welke: "I sent it about 9:00 o'clock this morning."

Supernaw: "Okay I got it at 4:30."

Welke: "Okay."

Kurtz: "Okay, can I continue on, Mr. Mayor?"

Campbell: "Please."

Kurtz: "You want to say something?"

Myer: "Yes, I definitely want to say, first of all so the facts are straight. Last year Luther operated out of the airport with neither insurance nor paying fees, without proof of insurance and it was no issue. So he was doing everything wrong last year, there was nobody raised an objection. And now that he is doing everything that he was asked to by the City to meet the licensing agreement, now it's a big issue. And one thing I want to add. I received one complaint and if I read Island Airways complaint letter which conveniently I received at about 4:00 this afternoon, or this morning, it was dropped off by Paul. And reading through this it says one of our pilots had a very close call with a skydiver operation on Thursday. No one from Island Airways contacted the Airport Manager. No one contacted the Assistant Airport Manager. I worked 72 hours last week and you think anybody could have told me there was a problem? No. We wait till City Council day to send me this letter. And not only did Island Airways not notify me that they that there was a problem, why not the pilot tell me that there was a safety issue? And it says this is an incredibly unsafe environment for all involved. If it's so unsafe how come nobody told the Airport Manager? And lastly on the next page it says over 300 arrivals and departures were in this three day period. You know how many complaints I received? I received this one today this morning. That's 300 operations in those three days and I can tell ya right now people at that airport have told me this is the busiest that airport's been during the five day period. And I can guarantee you, we did more than 300 operations and my crew did one hell of a job to get them in and out of there. And I had one complaint. And I can tell you this smells really bad and that's all I have to say about that." (applause)

Mayor: "We (applause covers up voices)."

Myer: "And another thing last year there was not one, I have the NOTAM log here, 'Notices to Airmen' that the airport issues when there's a skydiving operation, there was not one NOTAM issued last year during skydiving operations. You want to see how many were issued this year? They're in here. You want to look at it? You want the truth? It's right here."

Campbell: "Why didn't they say that in Harbor Springs, why do?"

Myer: "I don't want to hear about what Harbor Springs. We're talking about Charlevoix Airport."

Campbell: "I want to know how many airports locally have skydiving."

Myer: "I don't care about other airports. I care about my airport."

Campbell: "You care about the airport. You must not worry, because you didn't check off the insurance box. I noticed that."

Myer: "I didn't check off the box Mr. Mayor, but last year nobody even checked to see if he had insurance. He has insurance this year. He met every obligation that was required for that business license and."

Campbell: "Well I still think that it's insane."

Myer: "Well last year he didn't have it. This year he met every requirement according to what he was supposed to have and now it's an issue that he is doing everything. Plus I collected \$2,500 and last year."

Cole: "Which is a lot more than, yeah."

Myer: "And Luther came up to me and I said sorry buddy, I don't do deals."

Campbell: "Would you take full responsibility for any accidents that might occur? (audience noise) I just want to know. I wouldn't because I think it's dangerous."

Myer: "Well that's, you're entitled to your opinion. But like I said, Luther has not had any issues, I've not had any issues, and I told Luther that he could which map, could point out on the map, the airport map that during construction we had to move him over to that side of the field. And I told Luther once construction is completed he's going back over there, and right now there is still equipment there and I'm not going to have him jumping on dump trucks. Until he has a complaint, and I can guarantee you if he does something wrong he's going to hear about it from me. That's all I got to say about that."

Cole: "Thank you, Liz. (applause)"

Supernaw: "Liz can I ask you one quick question, what does NOTAM stand for?"

Myer: "NOTAM 'Notice to Airmen'. It's an advisory like if there is snow piling on a runway or if lights are out or an activity."

Supernaw: "Thank you."

Councilmember Porter: "The issue is not Luther versus aircraft taking off and on. The issue is an uninsured parachutist, okay, getting involved with an aircraft. Luther doesn't have anything to do with this whole thing. It's the parachutist, okay, who is going to be involved with this aircraft and the parachutist, okay, is uninsured. The City who thinks they have deep pockets, okay, would never if one of those Lear jets or one of those Gulfstream jets that fly in here, if one of those jets collides with a parachutist, trust me the City would never have pockets deep enough. They, we'd never have attorneys, we'd never have enough attorneys to defend the City and we've already been through that as Mayor Campbell said. We've already been through that once with the fireworks explosion. Everybody thought everything was great. Oh we're doing all the right things, we're launching these things right down on the shore next to the bridge, there can never be an accident, okay. I hear the same thing from Luther, there can never be a collision between an aircraft and a parachutist, it can never happen."

Cole and audience members: "He didn't say that."

Porter: "Well I say never say never, okay, and when it happens, and when it happens, okay, the City taxpayers and."

Supernaw: "Jeff, I believe the Mayor said the City also made out pretty good on the fireworks lawsuits, we pretty much prevailed, didn't we?"

Campbell: "We lost, we didn't have any money and they backed away, that's what happened."

Supernaw: "I call that winning." (audience noise) "I call that winning."

Kurtz: "Do you have an example of one time that's happened in history where a municipality was held liable for a parachutist?"

Porter: "Well, I don't have an example of that but I'm sure there are examples of parachutists colliding with aircraft."

Supernaw: "World War II."

Kurtz: "So do you have a question Councilman Porter?"

Cole: "I say we let Luther finish what he has to say."

Porter: "No, I'll let you finish what you have to say."

Kurtz: "So there was another email sent by a Councilmember and you know this. It's also a long email that outlines 11 things that were, that are now purportedly wrong with my operation since the last Council meeting. You know one thing, I just wanted to read it, says that 'it's disappointing that a City Councilmember cannot or will not follow the requirements and rules to operate his business at the airport.' And, you know, again this, that feels more like a political attack than it does about concern for the airport. So I know you all, just all have a copy of this and I just want you to know I do take all of this stuff seriously. And so any of these kind of things can be brought to my attention. You know we can discuss with the City risk manager those things. Anyway, the thing I wanted to talk about next was the FAA guidance which that a lot of us are thinking about. How do we know skydiving should take place at the airport, you know right? Well luckily the FAA has regulations for how you are required to operate when you are flying, when you're parachuting, you're using gliders, all kinds of things. They have regulations that have requirements and they also publish what's called Advisory Circulars and those provide suggestions about best practices for how different types of aviation should happen. So there is an Advisory Circular that covers skydiving and it's AC105-2E if you want to look it up and I can provide you a copy of it if you want one. So interestingly in Section 6, the first line of it is 'most parachute operations take place at airports including having the parachute landing area located on airport property'. So that tells us that that's where parachutes are supposed to land on airport property. I know that we all can come up with a whole bunch of ideas and hypotheticals about why that shouldn't happen but, the professionals that regulate the skies per the first line of Section 6 which talks about parachute operations on airports, says that most parachute operations take place at airports and the landing areas on the airport too. So you were asking about other users in the airport. So the next section is called 'Additional Aviation Activities'. Now that section says 'large number of airports that accommodate parachute operations also have different kinds of aviation activities taking place simultaneously including flight training, glider and helicopter operations, emergency medical services, sightseeing operations and aerobatic practice over or in the immediate vicinity of the airport. Many airports accommodate a large volume of transient traffic during skydiving operations.' So that's Section 6B in this Advisory Circular. You know and I will point out that I just came back from Arizona and the FAA, I guess what you'd call big shots from Washington, and they came out there and they did a safety study at the airport that I jump at. I'm currently jumping off the airport. I want to land on the airport and they did a safety study and that airport claims to have 328 operations every single day average all year long and the FAA found that skydiving was feasible at that airport. So I know that in one of the emails it said that we had 300 operations over a three day period and in this busy time and it shouldn't happen. Well now the guidance suggests that it is feasible and let's see, let me read to you number 3, so this would be 'Parachute Operations onto Airports,' Section 6, subsection C2, 'The FAA recommends that airport management work with parachute operators to develop standard procedures for activities conducted by parachutists'. And the reason they do that is so other operators can know what we're doing and where we're doing it and we have been working together on those procedures. And I've reached out to Island Airways and Fresh Air Aviation to develop procedures and up until today I was unaware of any conflict."

So let me just tell you about parachute landing areas and I'll move on from the FAA guidance. So one thing people are talking about where my landing area is and so in Section 5 it talks about parachute landing areas and it says 'The FAA recommends the areas used as parachute landing areas remain unobstructed with sufficient minimum radial distances to the nearest hazard' and then it says 'the guidelines and the USPA's basic safety requirements,' and the USPA again is the United States Parachute Association 'can be used in determining if the landing area is adequate.' So in your packet I showed a picture of where our landing area was and you know I outlined the minimal distance, I showed you where the requirements were in the USPA BSR's and then I drew the circle on the map showing the distance to the nearest hazards and it's more than adequate. Additionally the Vice President, I'll just point out now I'm going to bring it up again in a little bit, but you got a letter on your desk from the Vice President of the USPA. He also reviewed the landing area where we have it located on the airport and said that it appears to him that it's compliant with that. Now we did move and if you take the same radial circle between the two runways our landing area there also meets the requirements.

So the last thing I wanted to talk about was the insurance. You know Randy Allison from the USPA, oh here's the letter, he identified in a four-page letter that he wrote, he's the Regional Director which covers about five states around Michigan and he is also the Vice President of USPA and he wrote a letter discussing some things about USPA and also about."

Supernaw: "What is that Luther, USPA, Pilots Association?"

Kurtz: "United States Parachute Association. He discussed my operation a little bit here and around country and then he addressed some of the concerns and he identified that the standard practice around the country is that there's a liability release. And we have that. It's been drafted by an attorney. Perhaps our City Attorney could review it. We've been using it for 15 years. We have a general liability policy that covers the general liability when we are on the airport and we also as a kind of added bonus, the USPA for all members, not just group members, will cover the parachute if they like run into somebody's property or injure somebody up to \$50,000. So that's not a lot but, it covers off airport incidents as well. So that's an additional coverage. So you know finally he says that you know the kind of insurance that perhaps you are going to try to require me to get is not available in the US market at any cost. All skydiving centers in the U.S. operate and utilize coverage similar to or identical to those used by Skydive Harbor Springs and so this is what I offer you, I offer you the standard procedures and what people do all over the country at large cities and small cities, at large airports and small airports. This is what's allowed."

Porter: "Oh, Luther, excuse me. Why do you think insurance companies cannot offer or will not offer parachutist insurance? Is there a reason?"

Kurtz: "You know you could ask them that if you wanted."

Porter: "You think the risk managers at those insurance companies don't believe there's a serious risk?"

Kurtz: "You know I have an opinion about why they don't do it. I don't know if I want to get into how insurance companies think and what they think about when they offer things and don't offer things. Now if you have a concern about that you could ask the City's risk manager or maybe the City's insurance company, maybe the City Attorney."

Porter: "I think that's something we should do. We should ask the City's, we should ask the City insurance, we're insured through I think the Township Municipal League or something like that, yeah, Michigan Township Association or something like that. We should ask those folks about the risk having an airport and having."

Kurtz: "Skydiving on it."

Porter: "Skydiving operation at the airport."

Councilmember Gibson: "Mike, don't we have separate insurance for the airport?"

Interim City Manager Spencer: "We do and I think if I could interject one quick comment, Mayor. Obviously this is an important issue. There's members of the public that are concerned about it. Luther wants to maintain and do his skydive operation at the airport. Council has some concerns about liability. Those are all valid things. A lot of this information is new. Some of it we got via email today. We received probably 3 or 4 different emails in support of Luther's operation from operators and from pilots and we have one of course, that was mentioned from Island Airways. Scott has not had a chance to review everything and offer his opinion and obviously this is a complex subject. The real reason for this agenda item is for Liz to be able to present some things to Council, on changes she's made at the airport but, it's kind of morphed into a discussion on skydiving. So my recommendation, if Council's supportive of it, is to maybe take some comments tonight and have a special meeting after our City Attorney has had the ability to review everything. Maybe Luther would be okay with the City Attorney reviewing his full insurance policy, get some answers, get some standards from the FAA, maybe get input from the FAA and have a special meeting where we only talk about skydiving. And I think that would be a little bit more proactive than a heated debate or you know."

Campbell: "I think those are good ideas."

Spencer: "I think, you know I don't know much about it but, I'm sure people on Council other than Luther don't know much about it."

Campbell: "Why no other airport around here allows?"

Kurtz: "Well that's not true, Mr. Mayor."

Cole: "Hold on."

Kurtz: "I skydive at other airports around here, I skydive at the Yuba Airport. I skydive at the Empire Airport."

Spencer: "I think that's an example to get the facts before we."

Campbell: "I think that's a good idea."

Gibson: "I agree Mike."

Spencer: "Why don't we take some public comment, take a step back, and schedule a separate meeting where we only talk about skydiving, is that okay with you Mayor?"

Gibson: "Yes."

Campbell: "Yeah that's fine with me, and I would like Scott's input on."

Supernaw: "Yes, I would too."

Mayor: "Because."

Kurtz: "Mr. Mayor, if I could make one more comment?"

Campbell: "I just worry about the City. It's what I worry about. And next to the City I worry about starting all over, I just don't want to get cleaned out."

Kurtz: "You know if the City, what I would ask is that you try to find a way to make it work instead of directing our Attorney to find a way to make it not work."

Campbell: "I think that is a reasonable request."

Cole: "I agree with that Luther."

Kurtz: "Okay, well thank you for allowing me to talk. Sorry for taking all your time, Liz, the floor is yours. Oh, I guess sorry that was your job."

Gibson: "Comments. Comments."

Cole: "Are you going to have some public comment on that first, like Mike said?"

Campbell: "We can do that in miscellany or let her do."

Gibson: "Now. Now."

Cole: "I think now, would, let's just let them."

Campbell: "Anybody wants to come up and speak or forever hold your peace."

Cole: "The man."

Don Seelye: "I'm Don Seelye, I live at the airport. My grandson is one of the tandem jumpers, I love watching these guys, they're having a great time and I'm a big promoter of the airport and I'm used to all operations and safety ways having, we've got a great investment out there. We really need to get all we can out of it. Last year I voiced my concerns to Scott when he suggested that maybe they were going to jump here and I said well that's great except I'd like to see them land off the airport. I'm really concerned about them coming down right in the middle of the traffic pattern. By the way I'm also a pilot with about 3,500 hours, I've been at this airport since 1966 flying airplanes of my own. I'm a private pilot. Unbeknownst to me, Scott approved the jumping on Saturdays only as a trial period. He picked Saturday because Saturday was a fairly low traffic day and so that's how it happened last year. So this year it was approved based on last year's operation with no more discussion about how many days or so on and

so it just happened without much approval. It's a very distracting thing on busy days. I flew Beaver Island Thursday afternoon. When I took off there was so much radio traffic that you can understand it when you talk on an aircraft radio from 100 miles around you're hearing it at Charlevoix so when you're up in the air you're hearing all this chatter and there's other frequencies bumping each other, squeals on the radio so you don't hear anything and so the traffic reporting of the jump plane was blanked out quite a bit and even the traffic calling into the airport was blanked out some. And so it's unsafe in my opinion that we have this jumping especially on these really busy days. Friday was even worse. I didn't fly Friday but I talked to some people that did. In addition to all the traffic we had haze in the air so the parachutes blend into that haze, the grey colored chute quite often, sometimes red on them, sometimes blue, but they are hard to see when it's real hazy. So we've got this report of this jump plane saying that now there's jumpers coming down, where the hell are they? You're coming in trying to do a traffic pattern and try to miss this guy. This guy in the parachute he doesn't have a motor, he's coming down, he can't say you know, I'm gonna go around and try this again like an airplane can. So it creates a real situation. I hope it never happens. My grandson's one of them, you know it scares me death sometimes when he's up in the middle of this stuff. He's safe, he's done a great job, I've gone back and spent a day watching these guys jump especially on the north side, how they come in on the pattern and how they land. I mean they are doing it all right but they're really close to the airplanes and if somebody's a little off course on their approach you know sometimes you turn a little wide, different things, who knows. So look at my notes here, that's probably most of what I had to say about it but I'm really in favor of the jumping operation, I really am, but I think they really should land off airport. It's so great to see them there, it's fun to watch it, it brings people to the airport but man if somebody gets killed whether it's an airplane full of people or just one jumper it's a bad deal. By the way some corporate aircraft, the larger jets, are required, company required, that if they know a jump operation is going on at an airport they can't land there company rules. How do we know how much traffic we might lose from a jet if he's scheduled to come to Charlevoix but he finds out this is going on, they don't even get in the air. They go someplace else and they don't get in the air to come to Charlevoix so you never know that flight was meant to come here but didn't. So I'm in favor of the jumping, I really am, I just think that it should be off airport."

Campbell: "Thank you. Anybody else?"

Supernaw: "Don, are all you pilots on the same frequency or different channels? You get everything from Minneapolis Center?"

Seelye: "No, the UNICOM frequency is a basic 122.8 on the radio and they have a few of those, but the most basic one, Gaylord, Charlevoix, Boyne City, Beaver Island, all the local airports around all use the same. Pellston's a different UNICOM, though."

Supernaw: "Was that garbled before the parachuters started talking?"

Seelye: "Oh it can be on busy days, oh yeah, yeah."

Sandra Bennett: "My name is Sandra Bennett from Ward 1. My husband and I attend the Council meetings very often and on the very last meeting on June 15th when there was a little disagreement between a couple Councilmembers there was a question, a very polite question was raised and I'm sure a lot of people here know what that question was. I wrote my husband a little note that uh-oh Luther watch out because I felt like right after that comment there was going to be some repercussion. And honestly I thought it would be done a little less obvious than this, that all this commotion would not happen at the very next meeting. And so whether or not it's a political attack on him, that's what the community thinks, that's how the perception is. It may not be what your intention is but the perception of a community is that you all are attacking him for making a comment about why does why do you have to insult people by calling them names like hobos and gypsies, people don't like that and so because Luther brought (applause) that up I think this is directly related."

Cole: "The man in blue had his hand raised."

Campbell: "That guy first, he'd been up and down three times."

Terry Osterhout: "I moved here back to Michigan after growing up here and leaving 20-23 years ago. I grew up in Petoskey but spent my childhood living here, moved back with my young infant and my wife to start a new life in the area I grew up. When I got back to northern Michigan it wasn't the area that I recalled that it was. It was suffering and I couldn't find a job once I got back despite a good work history and so Luther Kurtz and Mary Kurtz hired me to manage their skydiving drop zones from Harbor Springs and saved my family and I worked for them for a year doing that. And then they said we love Charlevoix we want to buy the movie theatre and we know you made movies in New York City and ran video stores and have experience with them and we want you to run it. And so I made the commute from Harbor Springs and worked in the movie theatre for them and in my entire experience working for them I've seen them grow every single business that they touch and employ more and more people. And as manager of the movie theatre now it's expanding, we're hiring more people, just like at the skydiving center. Luther is not an amateur. He has multiple drop zones across the country and excellent safety records. I know this because I managed those drop zones or the phone center for them. I know that he is one of the most hard working decent human beings that I have ever known. I might be a little bit biased but, my experience in New York City gave me good insight into people. I know his heart and I know Mary's heart and I know how good they are for Charlevoix and I know how much they love this community and they would do anything to see it prosper. Now we recently moved to the First Ward, my wife and my son and I, because Harbor Springs and Petoskey show a lot less promise than Charlevoix and we didn't want to make the commute anymore. Charlevoix's got it together. They've got Venetian in the summer, they've got festivals going on and all the time. I talk to hundreds and hundreds of people every week that come to the

movie who love this town and you know what else they love? Skydiving. What Luther and Mary have done for the theatre and their tireless and selfless contributions and they're amazed we can see the skydivers from the window. I go to the beach with my young son every day and we can see them and people are enthusiastic and they love it. Northern Michigan needs young energy and growth to survive. Instead of seeing outrage over, full outrage I might add, over this we should be outraged that this construction took so many more weeks that it ought to of. (applause) And I, it's crippling the City. Terry from the Villager Pub, all the businesses around, the flower shop on the corner couldn't even get people to park and were talking about this and there's a pattern here. When you here about people being called gypsies and hobos and slandering small businesses that are trying to rise and grow the community and this is what we're worried about and now we're worried about skydiving after it's been going for this long. It is beneath the City Council, I can't wait to vote this November and we need to (applause) oppose. You all need to work together because you work for us. I love being in Charlevoix. Life here is so much better here than Petoskey with their giant hole and Harbor Springs that can't save themselves and businesses that are never open. But in Charlevoix businesses are open late every night and it's fantastic and it's growing and it's good for the community, good for northern Michigan. Thank you Mary and Luther." (applause)

Bob Ludwig: "Hi, my name is Bob Ludwig. We own a piece of property here in Charlevoix. We're not downstaters, we're out-of-staters. We've been coming to Charlevoix for many, many years. And I don't know all the ins and outs of this but, if you're going to talk about insurance make sure you have a representative from the insurance company to explain exactly what they cover. I can tell you from the City I come from which is Cincinnati, that we do have skydiving on airports. We have it at Lunken, we have it at Waynesville and we even have it on CVG, which is the main airport. Somehow in a much bigger city they make it work. I also think it's important that the City Council be very, very pro-business and anything (applause) and everything you can do to support the local business is very important to the growth and to the financial welfare of the City. I pay my taxes, are obviously a hell of a lot higher than the local residents, 30%, but you just can't depend on that, you need to support the local restaurants, support every business that is here so that they can bring more people from downstate, out-of-state to spend their bucks here because basically this whole economy as I see it happens in about a four month period. And so that's my comments." (applause)

Mayor: "Sir, you were up, no you."

Dave Gudritz: "Thank you, Mr. Mayor. My name is Dave Gudritz and I live at 204 Alice which is about 4 or 5 blocks from the airport. I'm in favor of Luther and skydiving and I hope my two Council people vote in favor of it also. My concern when we talk about procedures, I would like to talk with Island Airways, is she still here, about approaches. There's a pilot. Now Island Airways and me being about 4 or 5 blocks from the airport, when they take off to the east they go right directly over my house. Now isn't there an approach or isn't there a distance that they have to travel before they can, they don't, they can go and then when they land to the south they land on the grass and they got a fence to clear there and there's very little clearance. I've watched them come in there and it scares the heck out of me."

Seelye: "The airport was there first sir, if you want my comments again."

Gudritz: "No, I listen to them, sit down, I listen to them. So any airplane, I notice these jets they approach from way out, and they got a good view of what's going on at the airport. Island Airways they take off, they come in, at all different angles. I've seen jets discontinue their approach because of traffic coming in illegal if, it seemed to me to be illegal that you'd cut that corner that sharp."

Seelye: "Not at all."

Goodritz: "Not at all. Well it would concern me if I was talking about litigation or something like that. Airplanes coming together."

Seelye: "They're all talking to each other, sir." (voices talking over each other)

Mayor: "Is there anybody else? I guess we can get back to your report."

Supernaw: "Was that half of your report done with Liz or haven't you even started yet?"

Myer: "Well this is going to be short and sweet. I get to the point. I've been a licensed airport manager or assistant manager in the State of Michigan since 1984. I brought to Charlevoix my 31 years of aviation experience and expertise to manage the City's airport. I came out of retirement to do this. Arriving at Charlevoix I did what I have done at other airports I've managed in the past. I walk into the airport with the attitude that it's mine and I run it like a business. I submitted a listing of numerous major changes that I have implemented to improve not only the airport operations but the financial position of the airport. In addition to securing the federal funding of one million dollars for fiscal year 2015, by the way you're welcome, (audience laughter), by submitting the required airport access agreement to the FAA, the submitted implemented change I made according to my calculations totaled well over \$50,000. I would like to remind City Council that I've only been employed by the City for approximately seven months. I expected that City Council would support their airport and airport manager but after the last City Council meeting I was left in doubt and felt it necessary to address the issue. At the last Airport Advisory Committee meeting, the members of the Committee suggested that Dave Guanci, as a user of the airport, would be a good candidate for the vacant Airport Advisory Committee position as noted in the meeting minutes. Then at the last City Council meeting there's an agenda item that stated the following: 'The Airport Advisory Committee has one Airport User membership unfilled. The Committee is recommending David Guanci to fill the seat. This

is a Council appointment.' During the City Council meeting it was brought up by Councilmember Gibson that Scott Woody should be selected for this position and we all know the outcome of that vote. It was my understanding that the nominee of the Airport Advisory Committee was to be a user of the airport. To my knowledge Mr. Woody is not a user of the airport except for as an occasional passenger. It puzzles me as how a previous City employee who quit his position as the Airport Manager can be considered as a good candidate for the Airport Committee. If this individual cared so much about that Airport and its future, why did he resign his position with the City's Airport? In addition, I clearly stated that I have a personal issue with this nominee being selected as previously noted during Mr. Straebel's administration when the same person was suggested as a nominee. At that time individual Council members and the Mayor spoke to me in regard to my objections about this individual. Yet again, here we are months later. I raise the same objection that I had, that I had personal issue with this nominee being selected, as noted in the last Airport Advisory minutes. In spite of knowing this, Councilmember Gibson chose to support her previous Airport Manager versus supporting her current Airport Manager by not only ignoring the Airport Advisory Committee meeting's recommended selection of David Guanci, but ignoring her current Airport Manager's objections. By partaking in back door politics and at the last minute sliding in a nominee who is a close friend, and neighbor, into a committee position without the Airport Committee or individuals' knowledge so they would not be available to comment at the City Council meeting is a conflict of interest and in my opinion unethical politics. I am curious as to why there is even an Airport Committee, since the recommendations of the committee are being ignored and backdoor politics are used to satisfy a Councilmember's individual personal agenda. I feel ethical politics should be the norm and not the exception. I am a long standing respected airport manager in the aviation community and you are fortunate to have me employed as your airport manager (applause) to benefit from my 31 years of airport experience. I presented tonight a list of all the major discrepancies and corrective action taken at the airport and a list of my credentials. These are the facts and keep in mind that the truth has no motive or agenda. Thank you." (applause)

Campbell: "I guess you're not going to make your report then, is that correct?"

Myer: "Pardon?"

Campbell: "You didn't want to make your report?"

Myer: "My report that I listed lists all the discrepancies and, like I said, that is my report."

Campbell: "I just wanted to give you the opportunity to do that if you wanted."

Myer: "Nope, my report, the individual things I listed, like I said I more than paid my wages this year, so I don't owe anybody anything."

Gibson: "Liz, I have a question."

Myer: "Yes?"

Gibson: "In your report you have unaccounted fuel inventory that was actually from 4/2013 to 4/2014, before you were the airport manager."

Myer: "That is correct."

Gibson: "Why did you list that as having taken care of the problem? It's a meter problem."

Myer: "I took care of the problem by implementing a... there was no system there. Like I said, there was no system there to reconcile the cash and all the parking passes, which I stated in here are a lot of cash. There was no stub being retained by that airport, so the passes were being given out and at the end of the day nobody reconciled that the cash was there. They was no system to inventory the fuel. And since I have been there, there are so many people that I say, we have a card system now, every airplane that lands at that airport we keep track of, and we double check to make sure they paid. I can't tell you how many people came up to me and said, what it's not free anymore? Seriously? Seriously? And all I can say is by the end of the year, the first fiscal year, like Oakland County did, look at the numbers. And already, like I said with just retraining the staff, I eliminated two positions, seasonal positions, one part-time position. That's almost 40 some thousand dollars right there. And like I said, if you guys have questions, why don't you come out and ask people instead of going a roundabout way about things. How many people, I've seen a few members from City Council come out to the airport and ask what we've been doing. I haven't seen anybody else."

Gibson: "I was out there a week and a half ago, and you weren't there, and you never contacted me to come back out."

Porter: "I was out there Sunday."

Supernaw: "I was out there. We talked, several times, haven't we?"

Myer: "Yes, yeah we've talked several times. And like I said that the thing is the changes that have been made, it was never run as a business. And like I said, unfortunately it's not just, I treat it as mine, and this is not, it'll be interesting. All I can say it's going to be very interesting at the end of the fiscal year, that's all I can say."

Supernaw: "I have a question too, Mr. Mayor. Great minds think alike. I have a notation here on the same thing Shirley asked about. There was over two thousand gallons of Jet A fuel unaccounted for, what kind of money does that represent, 2,000 gallons approximately?"

Myer: "Matt's my fuel guy. You know what the cost is on, I'm going to have him come up because he was the one that presented me the inventory so."

Supernaw: "And one other question for you, or maybe Matt can handle it."

Airport Operations Manager Wyman: "Good afternoon Council, Mayor. Right now our Jet A cost is \$4.90 a gallon, back then it was in the neighborhood of \$5.15 or maybe a little more."

Supernaw: "\$10,000 or so."

Wyman: "Yep."

Supernaw: "It also says on here, according to my calculations, I assume those are yours Liz, operational cost to plow snow is seasonal and runs between \$6,000 and \$8,000 per snow event?"

Myer: "What it, since I also in my spare time I co-owned an excavating company. In order to calculate the cost you take the number of man hours, which we have with us, and I took a base of \$150.00 for one piece of equipment and that covers operational costs and since Matt was there last, the previous year, who had to plow the runway, I told him this year nobody - no airport manager that I know plows a seasonal runway and because of the cost and expense. And again I act like it's my airport and if it was mine would I spend the money to plow that runway that's not really used? So, no, but anyway Matt has the figures we calculated on that so."

Supernaw: "I have another question for you when Matt's done."

Wyman: "Yeah, just real quick. That year, that winter as we all know, was a hell of a winter. I think we had over 200 inches of snow here in Charlevoix. The first time we opened up the runway it roughly took about 12 hours. I think we opened the runway an additional four other times at about four hours per opening. And then I myself because there's so much snow, as the pilot when you pull up to runway 27 you need to be able to clear any traffic coming down or not and those banks were impeding your view so I spent two days, eight hours a piece in our loader, just shoveling snow, moving it out onto our ramp."

Supernaw: "If it's snowing, you just don't go out and plow at 8:00 in the morning and go home, do you?"

Wyman: "No, we start at 5:00 sir."

Supernaw: "Okay."

Wyman: "Anyways, just a rough estimate of 44 hours at \$160 an hour you're in the neighborhood of \$7,000 for that winter."

Gibson: "Matt, do you leave the runway open for Island Airways? Don't they use that in the winter?"

Wyman: "Per the A/FD NOTAM, that's closed November through April and we had it open that one winter."

Gibson: "Okay."

Wyman: "It is my understanding when they had the FBO the runway wasn't open."

Gibson: "Thank you."

Question from the audience (unintelligible): "...the board said \$6,000 to \$7,000 per incident?"

Matt: "No, it's for the winter."

Supernaw: "It says on here, per event."

Gibson: "Right."

Supernaw: "Liz, I also have the minutes from the Airport Advisory meeting on May 27th. Did they have a meeting today by the way?"

Wyman: "No."

Supernaw: "I've been asked, I want to be notified of those meetings please. It says on here in the minutes, you referred to this, 'with respect to filling the vacant advisory seat, Member Seelye', we talked about this Don, 'asked Mr. Dave Guanci if he was interested in filling the seat on the advisory committee. Mr. Guanci said he would be happy to serve on the committee. Mr. Guanci did mention that he would only be able to attend the meetings for 5 or 6 months if meetings were held once a month. Member Gibson said that the agenda could be emailed to him. Interim City Manager Mike Spencer added the committee could meet and just conference Mr. Guanci by a speaker phone. After public comment, Seelye came back to the vacancy on the committee and wanted to nominate either Mr. Dave Guanci or Mr. Scott Woody. Due to personal conflict between herself and Scott Woody, Liz Myer would vote for Guanci and not for Woody. It was then the general consensus of the committee that Mr. Guanci be appointed to fill the vacant seat.' Then it goes on to say, 'Mr. Woody stated he didn't understand the personal conflict that Liz Myer had with him. Also Mr. Woody stated that he took offense with being blamed for the RTTF not being submitted.' That is what? RTTF quickly."

Myer: "That is the, if you go the items that I submitted, it's about the funding, it's the letter I have from the FAA. If you read the starred area, it says please be reminded that on October 1st, 2014, airport sponsors, which is the City."

Supernaw: "Is it a big deal?"

Myer: "Yes, it is, because it was due by October 1st of 2014 in order to be eligible for the funding for fiscal 2015 as stated in the FAA letter. I started in November so if it takes anywhere from 6 to 9 months typically, with FAA things, and of course we had issues with that, but we did get it submitted, we did get the funding for fiscal year 2015. But again, it says right here, October 1st, 2014, the access plan was due. I wasn't there, who was working?"

Supernaw: "Okay. Let me quickly wrap up here, where it says Mr. Woody took offense, he said he does not understand the personal conflict Liz Myer had with him. At the suggestion of another Council person, about a month after I was elected I had breakfast with him, and we talked. And I don't know him well, but I met him, it's the only time we've ever met, in fact. He told me his problem with you, and he told me his problem with the former City Manager, Mr. Straebel. So, to state that he doesn't understand the personal conflict maybe was, I'm not sure. My question, my thought is this, it's incredible. I'm impressed with people that are paying attention to this in Charlevoix, and the pilots that are here. Why would someone want to serve? This would be like you getting a divorce and some judge putting your ex-husband as the executor of your estate."

Myer: "Exactly, exactly."

Supernaw: "Why would he want to come someplace that he's not wanted? I think Mr. Guanci might be here, I had a conversation with him and he would like to be on the board. He was on the agenda, his name was in print and his name was never brought up."

Myer: "It wasn't. I don't know what happened. And all I can say is that as the committee stands now, it'll probably be a very cold day in Charlevoix before I ask for an Airport Committee meeting, since I am the chairperson of that committee, because I don't see how it's going to be very productive. How's it going to be productive?"

Supernaw: "That's disappointing."

Myer: "It is."

Supernaw: "I've been assured by Council people and the Mayor."

Campbell: "I'd like you to wrap it up now."

Supernaw: "Okay."

Campbell: "Number one you could have made the motion, you were on that committee."

Supernaw: "That's not true Mr., never mind, we'll bring that up at a later date."

Campbell: "We will."

Supernaw: "There was a nomination made that wasn't on the agenda and you said call for the vote. Almost that quick, there was no discussion. Luther and I asked what happened to David Guanci and then I read in an email that someone changed their mind."

Campbell: "I didn't have any idea who was going to be nominated."

Supernaw: "It was on the agenda printed out."

Campbell: "It was on the agenda to appoint somebody but that's a Council decision and I don't mess with the Council."

Supernaw: "A Council decision, not a Council person's decision."

Campbell: "A Council decision."

Supernaw: "No one asked me who I'd like to nominate. Dave Guanci's name was on the agenda I can bring that for you."

Campbell: "You don't seem to mind jumping up and asking a lot of questions, I'm surprised you didn't jump up and make that nomination."

Supernaw: "Because you called for the vote after the nomination was made. But I don't know if Mr. Guanci would like to say something tonight or not, but I, I don't know if he's disappointed or not, but people are saying what happened to Dave Guanci, he's a nice guy."

Myer: "Well, it's not only that he's a user of the airport, and that was the idea of it, was to get people involved who are users of the Airport. And like I said, it's that since I have personal issue, I like the way you put it actually, but I explained to not only the Mayor, but different Council members, why I had issue with Mr. Woody. And he is stating that I've been his friend for 25 years, et cetera. I would not, he was my airport tenant, and that's how I knew him. If I had, I don't need friends like that, so."

Supernaw: "Thank you, Liz. Sorry, Mr. Mayor for taking up so much time."

Campbell: "Are you done with your report then?"

Myer: "I'm done."

Campbell: "Thank you for your report."

Myer: "Thanks." (applause)

Dave Guanci: "They nominated me or asked me to be on it. I go to Florida for six months, I'm very busy with my vineyard so I'm happy to help out but, I am a busy guy. So I don't know what the problem is with everyone else but, I'm happy to help but, I'm not available all the time, that's all I can tell you."

Campbell: "Well I haven't heard anybody say anything negative about you so."

Guanci: "Okay, great. I hope not. I got a big investment out at that airport. Okay."

Kurtz: "Mr. Mayor, can I make one comment please."

Campbell: "Sure."

Kurtz: "I just want to say that I heard some people boo when Don was talking, and I just want to say that I consider Don a friend and we do disagree on things but, I have a lot of respect for Don. So I just wanted to say that. Thank you."

Campbell: "Good to have you back."

Kurtz: "I'm back. Thank you, Mr. Mayor."

End of Agenda Item D verbatim.

E. Mandated FOIA Changes

Beginning July 1, 2015, significant new regulations took effect governing how public bodies administer and respond to requests under the Freedom of Information Act (FOIA), PA 442 of 1976. The changes impact nearly every area of FOIA, including local policies required for FOIA administration, fees categories and methods of calculation, good-faith deposits and fee waivers, records available on the public body's website, and the appeal process, including significant new penalties.

The most significant change made by the amendment is that public bodies are required to establish specific written procedures and guidelines to implement FOIA, including a standard fee itemization form, and separate written public summary which must be posted on the City's website. Another significant area of change is the categories and manner in which fees may be charged.

The Clerk's Office has published the mandatory Procedures and Guidelines and subsequent Summary which have been approved

by the City Attorney. The Clerk's Office has also published the required forms, thus adhering to the new legislation. The 2015/2016 budgeted labor FOIA fee should be amended to reflect the new fifteen minute increment.

Mayor Campbell opened the item to public comment. There was no comment, and the item was closed.

Action by Resolution.

VIII. Introduction and Initial Actions Relating to Ordinances or to Resolutions That Require Publication or Hearings Prior to Final or Further Action

None.

IX. Resolutions

A. Request by Charlevoix Yacht Club for Free Parking

Motion by Councilmember Supernaw, second by Councilmember Cole, to adopt Resolution 2015-07-01 Waive Parking Fees for Charlevoix Yacht Club, as follows:

**CITY OF CHARLEVOIX
RESOLUTION NO. 2015-07-01
WAIVE PARKING FEES FOR CHARLEVOIX YACHT CLUB**

WHEREAS, the Charlevoix Yacht Club is hosting the Nucore Triangle Race on September 4th and the Red Fox Regatta on September 5th and 6th, 2015; and

WHEREAS, the Charlevoix Yacht Club is requesting that parking fees be waived for the races; and

WHEREAS, the City Code permits the City Council to waive parking fees for special or public events.

NOW THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED, that the City Council of the City of Charlevoix, hereby waives parking fees for the Nucore Triangle Race on September 4th and the Red Fox Regatta on September 5th and 6th, 2015.

RESOLVED, this 6th day of July, 2015, A.D.

Resolution adopted by the following yea and nay vote:

Yeas: Porter, Kurtz, Perron, Gibson, Cole, Supernaw
Nays: None
Absent: None

B. Mandated FOIA Changes

Motion by Councilmember Kurtz, second by Councilmember Cole, to adopt Resolution 2015-07-02 Mandated FOIA Regulations per PA 563 of 2014, as follows:

**CITY OF CHARLEVOIX
RESOLUTION NO. 2015-07-02
MANDATED FOIA REGULATIONS PER PA 563 OF 2014**

WHEREAS, significant new regulations took effect on July 1, 2015 governing how public bodies administer and respond to requests under the Freedom of Information Act (FOIA), PA 442 of 1976; and

WHEREAS, the changes are the result of HB 4001, which was signed into law by the governor on January 11, 2015 as PA 563 of 2014; and

WHEREAS, the changes impact nearly every area of FOIA, including local policies required for FOIA administration, fees categories and methods of calculation, good-faith deposits and fee waivers, records available on the public body's website, and the appeal process; and

WHEREAS, that public bodies are required to establish specific written Procedures and Guidelines to implement FOIA, including a standard fee itemization form and separate written public summary and post these on the City's website; and

WHEREAS, the City of Charlevoix City Council approved the 2015/2016 budget for the FOIA labor fees charging for the cost of labor exceeding 30 minutes; and

WHEREAS, the City Clerk has published and made available, the mandated FOIA policies, procedures, documents, fee categories and forms.

NOW THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that the City of Charlevoix adopts the mandated FOIA policies, procedures, documents, fee categories and forms published by the City Clerk in compliance with PA 563 of 2014; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the City of Charlevoix City Council amend the FOIA labor fee charging for the cost of labor exceeding 15 minutes.

RESOLVED, this 6th day of July, 2015 A.D.

Resolution adopted by the following yeas and nay votes:

Yeas: Porter, Kurtz, Perron, Gibson, Cole, Supernaw
Nays: None
Absent: None

X. Ordinances

None.

XI. Miscellaneous Business

Councilmember Gibson brought up the topic of food trucks after receiving a complaint from a downtown business owner. Discussion ensued. Mr. Dan Barron stated that downtown restaurants cannot support the amount of customer traffic during Venetian Festival. Interim City Manager Spencer suggested that a food truck discussion should be held in the fall and Council generally agreed.

Councilmember Porter noted a discrepancy with the updated sidewalk ordinance verbiage. City Clerk Golding suggested that this may be a clerical error and she would look into the issue.

Councilmember Supernaw requested confirmation from Lonnie Allen, Charlevoix Courier editor, that a particular email did not originate from Councilmember Supernaw. Mr. Allen responded that he did not have to address private business with Council. Councilmember Supernaw read portions of the email which noted a flood of complaints on numerous issues over the last week. The email recommended that differences should be resolved in a non-threatening, transparent, more positive manner. Councilmember Supernaw suggested that in light of the recent issues, people "are laughing at us". Mayor Campbell stated that no one on Council is anti-business. Councilmember Supernaw and Cole took exception to the mayor's statement. Mayor Campbell stated that if people have a legitimate complaint regarding a business, then it should be heard by the City without accusations of harassment by the business.

Interim City Manager Spencer stated businesses are being treated equally with regards to ordinance complaints, but this is not accurately reflected in the press. He indicated that three newspaper articles regarding one business were published the last week, while there was no mention of the long awaited Lake to Lake Trail opening. Interim City Manager Spencer stated for the record that the City needs "better and fair press coverage and reporting all of the things: not just the negative things, but all the positive things that this community has to offer". He felt that everyone, including the press, needs to do a better job promoting the community and not just focus on the negative.

Councilmember Cole extended kudos to Rich Bergmann of the Round Lake Group. He also stated that Councilmember Kurtz has bent over backwards with regards to his sky diving operation and has done a fantastic job. Councilmember Cole agreed that the City Attorney should review Skydive Harbor Springs operation details and insurance coverage.

XII. Audience - Non-agenda Input (written requests take precedent)

Kirk Ikens, 108 W. Hurlbut, requested that the cement curb be replaced in front of his home rather than the scheduled rolled asphalt curb. He understands budget constraints, but felt that his property value will suffer with the asphalt curb as well as affecting the street aesthetics. Future street improvements were discussed. Interim City Manager Spencer cautioned that Council would be setting precedence by approving this request. It was generally agreed to spend up to \$10,000 of reserve money to install curb and gutter, laying asphalt on the entire street. Interim City Manager Spencer will communicate with Council if the estimate exceeds \$10,000.

Derek Chowen, Lake Charlevoix Brewing Company, thanked everyone for participating in the Council meeting and extended his appreciation to Councilmember Supernaw for clarifying facts in the newspaper. Mr. Chowen stated that the Round Lake Group is doing their best to make a good business and rectify any mistakes. The Round Lake Group wants to be a part of the community and work together.

Don Seeyle, discussed airport history, Mr. Woody's aviation experience, and commended Mr. Woody's efforts while in the position of Airport Manager. He felt that Mr. Woody's membership on the Airport Advisory Committee would be a huge benefit to the airport. Interim City Manager Spencer clarified that his previous reluctance to meet with ex-employee Mr. Woody was due to the fact that Mr. Seeyle should have been meeting with the current Airport Manager, not the former. Councilmember Supernaw asked Mr. Seeyle why the

committee unanimously recommended Mr. Guanci for membership. Mr. Seeyle replied that Mr. Guanci showed interest in the position.

Bob Timms, was concerned that Council was not aware of the revised plans for the Antrim Street – State Street intersection. He felt that the City would be losing four parking spaces. Interim City Manager Spencer will research the issue and email Council with his findings.

It was generally agreed to recess at 9:58 p.m. Council reconvened at 10:04 p.m.

XIII. Closed Session

- A. City Attorney Consultation – Section 15.268 (8)(h)
Motion by Councilmember Kurtz, second by Councilmember Cole, to go into Closed Session for a consultation with the City Attorney, citing Section 15.268(8)(h) of the Open Meetings Act.

Yeas: Porter, Kurtz, Gibson, Cole
Nays: None
Absent: Perron, Supernaw

Council moved into closed session at 10:04 p.m. Council resumed open session at 10:24 p.m.

XIV. Adjourn

The Mayor stated if there were no objections, the meeting would adjourn. There were no objections.
Meeting adjourned at 10:24 p.m.

Joyce Golding

City Clerk

Gabe Campbell

Mayor

Special Accounts Payable – 06/11/2015

BRIAN DIXON PAINTING	920.00		
THUNDER BAY RESORT	1,300.00	TOTAL	2,220.00

Special Accounts Payable – 06/12/2015

LARSON, KATHERINE	7,500.00	TOTAL	7,500.00
-------------------	----------	--------------	-----------------

Special Accounts Payable – 06/22/2015

AT&T	1,917.11	METLIFE SMALL BUSINESS CENTER	744.45
AT&T MOBILITY	72.61	PRIORITY HEALTH	45,958.41
CHARLEVOIX STATE BANK	4,288.35	VERIZON WIRELESS	56.72
DELTA DENTAL	4,771.88	VISION SERVICE PLAN	554.69
DTE ENERGY	6,052.69		
GREAT LAKES ENERGY	203.01	TOTAL	64,619.92

Special Accounts Payable – 07/01/2015

MICHIGAN JAZZ TRAIL BIG BAND	1,000.00	TOTAL	1,000.00
------------------------------	----------	--------------	-----------------

Regular Accounts Payable – 07/07/2015

AIRGAS USA LLC	1,280.15	FISHER SCIENTIFIC	952.05
ALL-PHASE ELECTRIC SUPPLY CO.	595.63	FORRESTER, KATHERINE	37.10
AMSTUTZ, LINDA	289.66	FUHRMAN, DANIEL	33.71
ANYBATTERY INC.	112.05	GALLAGHER, ART	83.56
ARROW UNIFORM-TAYLOR L.L.C.	1,036.30	GALLIMORE, SARAH	43.00
AT&T LONG DISTANCE	43.96	GALLOUP	1,075.68
AVFUEL CORPORATION	53,119.02	GALLS AN ARAMARK COMPANY	275.36
B & L SOUND INC	471.81	GERBER HOMEMADE SWEETS	45.00
BAILLARGEON, JOSEPH	31.20	GOLDING, JOYCE	41.00
BIOTECH AGRONOMICS INC	12,526.16	GORDON FOOD SERVICE	39.97
BLACK PEARL PLATINUM BRAND	25.00	GRAINGER	148.88
BOB MATHERS FORD	172.91	GRAPHIC CONTROLS LLC	427.32
BOSS, LINDA K.	825.00	GREAT LAKES ELEVATOR LLC	319.50
BUDAY'S SOUND ADVICE	3,836.06	GREAT LAKES PIPE & SUPPLY	623.37
CALDWELL, THOMAS	82.14	GREAT LAKES PIPE & SUPPLY	111.22
CCI SOUTH LLC	693.50	GRP ENGINEERING INC.	7,354.96
CENTRAL DRUG STORE	6.59	GSK ENTERPRISES LLC	450.00
CHARLEVOIX AGENCY	749.70	GUNTZVILLER, RHONDA	143.00
CHARLEVOIX SCREEN MASTERS INC	4,560.50	HAGGARD'S INC	1,763.00
CHARLEVOIX TOWNSHIP	15.00	HANKINS, SCOTT	41.00
CHARTER COMMUNICATIONS	999.20	HARRELL'S	4,730.12
CHEMICAL SYSTEMS INC.	1,872.00	HARWOOD GOLD	249.00
CHESAPEAKE GROUP INC.	5,500.00	HEID, THOMAS J.	41.00
COOK FAMILY FARMS	277.00	HI-LINE	125.88
COVEYOU FARMS LLC	84.00	HOLIDAY COMPANIES	7,254.04
CSI EMERGENCY APPARATUS LLC	11.27	HYDE SERVICES LLC	388.81
CUMMINS BRIDGEWAY LLC	2,502.49	IDEXX DISTRIBUTION INC.	1,234.37
DAMOUR, DAVID	26.00	INDEPENDENT DRAFTING SERVICES	1,260.00
DCASSESSING SERVICES	4,371.08	INDUSTRIAL MARKETING	2,248.73
DeROSIA, PATTY	41.00	J & B MEDICAL SUPPLY INC.	19.90
DHASELEER, CARL	102.00	JACK DOHENY SUPPLIES INC	469.94
DISTRICT 21 SOFTBALL	100.00	JOHN E. GREEN COMPANY	799.27
DITCH WITCH SALES OF MICHIGAN	1,351.14	JOHNNY MAC'S SPORTING GOODS	140.58
DOAN, GERARD	41.00	KELLERVILLE	300.00
DOYLE, ANNIE	391.00	KERBY, MICHELLE	70.00
DTE ENERGY	55.18	KIRINOVIC, THOMAS	41.00
EJ USA INC.	513.05	KLOOSTER, ALIDA K.	41.00
ELLIOTT, PATRICK M.	41.00	KORTHASE FLINN	11.25
ELMER'S CRANE & DOZER INC.	59,260.00	KSS ENTERPRISES	2,246.93
EMERGENCY MEDICAL PRODUCTS INC	112.70	LAKESHORE TIRE & AUTO SERVICE	14.95
ETNA SUPPLY	1,960.00	LERMA INC.	75.00
EVANS, HAL	41.00	LEVINE, STUART	53.41
FARMER WHITE'S	160.00	LOTTIE'S BAGELS	109.00
FASTENAL COMPANY	59.63	LYONS, SHELIA	59.13
FERGUSON & CHAMBERLAIN	2,876.00	MARSCHNER, JOHN	2,322.23

MATTER, DAWSON	390.00	RICK-BIDDICK, MICHELLE	1,021.14
MCCARDEL CULLIGAN-PETOSKEY	250.00	RTI LABORATORIES INC.	31.00
McGINN, KELLY	72.49	RUSTIC BAKER	45.00
MDC CONTRACTING LLC	630.00	S & S WORLDWIDE	1,338.77
METTLER CONCEPTS & DESIN	325.87	SCHWAGER, EDWARD J.	41.00
MICHIGAN APPRAISAL CO INC	1,200.00	SEARS COMMERCIAL ONE	650.23
MICHIGAN BOATING INDUSTRIES ASSOC	295.00	SECURITY SANITATION INC.	380.00
MICHIGAN MUNICIPAL LEAGUE	5,040.49	SEELEY'S PRINTING SERVICE	825.00
MICHIGAN MUSHROOM MARKET LLC	20.00	SMOKE ON THE WATER	20.00
MICHIGAN POLICE EQUIPMENT	969.65	SPARTAN DISTRIBUTORS INC	2,064.22
MID STATES BOLT & SCREW CO	51.04	SPEEDWRENCH INC.	355.34
MYER, ELIZABETH A.	41.00	SPENCER, MICHAEL	41.00
NORTH COUNTRY POWER GENERATION	235.00	STATE OF MICHIGAN	126,155.21
NORTHERN CREDIT BUREAU	290.51	STATE OF MICHIGAN	50.00
NORTHERN MICHIGAN DUST CONTROL	288.00	STEIN, DONNA	10.40
NORTHERN MICHIGAN JANITORIAL	87.35	SUPERNAW, BILL	20.70
NORTHERN SAFETY CO INC	773.25	SURE SOURCE	217.09
NORTHWEST DESIGN GROUP	3,974.25	SWEM, DONALD L.	41.00
NYE UNIFORM CO	104.45	T & R SERVICE INC	3,856.00
OLSON BZDOK & HOWARD	2,836.50	TERMINAL SUPPLY CO	470.59
OMS COMPLIANCE SERVICES INC	78.75	TEUNIS, STEVEN	242.25
ORIENTAL TRADING COMPANY INC	1,364.35	THREE OAKS WOODWORKING	451.12
OUDBIER INSTRUMENT CO	551.00	TRAEGER, JASON	142.00
PARASTAR INC.	1,058.46	UMULIS, MATTHEW	299.40
PERFORMANCE ENGINEERS INC	19,109.25	UP NORTH PROPERTY SERVICES LLC	5,811.00
PETOSKEY PUBLIC SCHOOLS	1,000.00	USA BLUE BOOK	173.87
POLLARD WATER	69.48	VILLAGE GRAPHICS INC.	254.45
POND HILL FARM LLC	200.00	WALTERS SHARPENING SVC. INC.	72.00
POWER LINE SUPPLY	957.47	WELLER, LINDA	41.00
PREFERRED WASTE 2 LLC	120.00	WHITLEY, ANDREW	14.00
PREIN & NEWHOF	51,009.76	WHOLLY GRANOLY LLC	9.00
PRESTON FEATHER	268.65	WOJAN WINDOW & DOOR CORP.	18.50
PROVIDENCE FARM LLC	98.00	WOOD SHOP, THE	500.00
QUICK CARE MEDICAL CENTER	144.00	WORK & PLAY SHOP	187.63
QUILL CORP	246.90	WURST, RANDALL W.	362.12
REHMANN-ROBSON & CO	3,900.00	WYMAN, MATTHEW A.	170.95
RESIDEX LLC	978.24	TOTAL	446,946.44

ACH Payments – 06/15/2015 – 07/06/2015

MI PUBLIC POWER AGENCY	9,578.88	MI PUBLIC POWER AGENCY	15,833.59
IRS (PAYROLL TAX DEPOSIT)	39,178.88	IRS (PAYROLL TAX DEPOSIT)	39,936.48
ALERUS FINANCIAL (HCSP)	370.00	ALERUS FINANCIAL (HCSP)	370.00
STATE OF MI (WITHHOLDING TAX)	5,753.13	STATE OF MI (WIHOLDING TAX)	5,690.63
VANTAGEPOINT (457 ICMA PLAN)	13,609.13	VANTAGEPOINT (457 ICMA PLAN)	13,764.46
MERS (DEFINED BENEFIT PLAN)	26,670.84	MI PUBLIC POWER AGENCY	9,908.01
MI PUBLIC POWER AGENCY	13,374.77		
MI PUBLIC POWER AGENCY	258,415.64	TOTAL	452,454.44

PAYROLL: NET PAY

Pay Period Ending 06/13/2015 – Paid 06/19/2015

WELLER, LINDA JO	1,620.71	HANKINS, SCOTT A.	1,489.79
GOLDING, JOYCE M.	1,059.15	ORBAN, BARBARA K.	1,340.84
DEROSIA, PATRICIA E.	971.47	TRAEGER, JASON A.	1,318.50
DOYLE, ANNE E.	1,385.05	WARNER, JANINE M.	851.52
LOY, EVELYN R.	1,017.73	EVANS JR, HALBERT K.	1,442.49
KLOOSTER, ALIDA K.	1,447.08	GODDARD, RYAN D.	551.33
GOLOVICH, KAREN J.	704.07	BINGHAM, LARRY E.	1,046.00
SPENCER, MICHAEL D.	2,238.33	VANLOO, JORDAN C.	619.18
SPENCLEY, PATRICIA L.	1,561.31	TELGENHOF, WILL G.	261.11
PANOFF, ZACHARY R.	631.71	GREYERBIEHL, KELLY M.	465.22
MILLER, FAITH G.	34.41	SCHWARTZFISHER, JOSEPH L.	1,617.74
LEESE, MERRI C.	284.05	ROLOFF, ROBERT P.	3,816.73
MCGINN, KELLY A.	1,585.98	BRODIN, WILLIAM C.	1,459.74
DOAN, GERARD P.	1,644.23	RILEY, DENISE M.	408.40
SHRIFT, PETER R.	1,284.22	TEUNIS, STEVEN L.	1,681.68
SCHLAPPI, JAMES L.	1,095.23	WURST, RANDALL W.	1,657.02
UMULIS, MATTHEW T.	1,364.08	MAYER, SHELLEY L.	1,557.82

HILLING, NICHOLAS A.	1,092.80	MYER, ELIZABETH A.	1,622.72
MEIER III, CHARLES A.	1,256.45	VANLOO, JOSEPH G.	796.97
ZACHARIAS, STEVEN B.	1,327.51	WYMAN, MATTHEW A.	955.66
NISWANDER, JOSEPH F.	1,382.44	DRAVES, MICHAEL J.	384.68
EATON, BRAD A.	1,896.70	SCHRADER, LOU ANN	622.65
WILSON, TIMOTHY J.	1,926.77	SCHWAGER, EDWARD J.	778.54
LAVOIE, RICHARD L.	2,240.24	BOSS, RYDER S.	225.34
STEVENS, BRANDON C.	1,925.57	FUNKEY, KRAIG R.	124.67
DRAVES, MARTIN J.	1,581.93	RILEY, TIMOTHY C.	52.86
BROWN, STEPHANIE C.	1,023.66	RAMSEY, KYLE J.	3.21
ELLIOTT, PATRICK M.	1,762.40	RILEY, CASEY W.	472.04
WELLS JR., DONALD E.	1,194.66	THORMAN, MIKAYLA R.	228.47
BRADLEY, KELLY R.	1,667.57	JONES, LARRY M.	968.83
WILSON, RICHARD J.	1,194.33	LOPER II, GARY D.	702.32
HART II, DELBERT W.	828.72	WILLSON, BRENDA R.	281.92
JONES, ROBERT F.	1,370.66	OCHS, THOMAS F	41.56
DORAN, JUSTIN J.	1,173.48	TRAVERS, MANUEL J.	1,089.31
MANKER JR, DAVID W.	493.95	RILEY, DANIEL A.	1,327.43
MANKER SR, DAVID W.	717.35	KLOOSTER, PATRICK H.	382.94
NEUMANN, DANA L.	536.31	JOHNSON, KYLE W.	434.53
BECKER, MICHAEL S.	554.09	LABELLE, DAVIS B.	333.02
SHEPARD, ZACHARY N.	502.73	KLINGER, LUCAS D.	580.41
BUTLER, SEAN C.	650.90	GREENE, GLORIA C.	478.39
HAWKINS, JAMES S.	438.25	KLINGER, BRADLEY W.	208.00
MCGHEE, ROBERT R.	943.00	DAVIS, LEAH R.	314.22
STANTS, JACOB W.	494.36	SWEM, DONALD L.	1,808.24
BLOOMER, GABRIELLE J.	505.36	WHITLEY, ANDREW T.	1,342.77
KIRINOVIC, THOMAS F.	620.18	MORRISON, KEVIN P.	868.50
STEBE, LAURA A.	109.14	HODGE, MICHAEL J.	1,270.61
FORRESTER, KATHERINE A.	544.88	JOHNSON, STEVEN P.	1,264.89
AMSTUTZ, LINDA J.	493.15	BISHAW, JAMES H.	632.13
DUTCHER, ROBERT G.	365.01	HERRIMAN, COBY M.	408.47
SABSOOK, SARA E.	117.05	MACGILLIVRAY, RAYMOND L.	79.13
BROSIO, VALERIE L.	114.28	HALL, CHASE D.	114.59
WEBB, MICHAEL B.	205.42	PETERS, MEGAN M.	134.99
PARKER-DROST, HERO	74.89	HOLM, ARTHUR R.	540.51
HOLECHECK, JENNACA R.	121.70	CURTIS, DENNIS E.	781.01
ROCKAFELLOW, SARAH C.	84.38	GILL, DAVID R.	1,008.90
HEID, THOMAS J	1,252.44	TODD, RICHARD D.	501.10
STEIN, DONNA E.	252.28	STEVENS, JEFFREY W.	602.49
BOOTHE, STEVEN A.	268.24	ROLOFF, AUDREY M.	2,950.91
GRUNCH, RONALD J.	294.20	MATTER, DAWSON K.	1,901.58
RYPSTRA III, BART	226.57	SCOTT JR., WINFIELD	26.42
DAVIS, RONALD L.	220.22	KITELEY, FISHER L.	26.42
MACLEOD, SAMUEL R.	371.61	BERGMANN, DOUGLAS M.	13.21
DAKROUB, JOSEPH E.	146.03		
MASSON, DONALD J.	135.41	TOTAL	107,900.75

PAYROLL: TRANSMITTAL – 06/19/2015

4FRONT CREDIT UNION	218.46	CHEMICAL BANK	150.00
AMERICAN FAMILY LIFE	145.20	COMMUNICATION WORKERS OF AMER	496.16
AMERICAN FAMILY LIFE	271.20	MI STATE DISBURSEMENT UNIT	502.40
CHAR EM UNITED WAY	32.00	PRIORITY HEALTH	1,809.98
CHARLEVOIX STATE BANK	1,021.16	TOTAL	4,646.56

PAYROLL: NET PAY

Pay Period Ending 06/27/2015 – Paid 07/02/2015

CAMPBELL, GABRIEL M.	932.73	GOLOVICH, KAREN J.	891.61
GIBSON, SHIRLEY J.	689.53	SPENCER, MICHAEL D.	2,457.72
PORTER, JEFFREY L.	544.01	SPENCLEY, PATRICIA L.	1,561.31
PERRON, LEON R.	449.96	PANOFF, ZACHARY R.	626.91
KURTZ, LUTHER J.	443.28	LEESE, MERRI C.	262.02
SUPERNAW, WILLIAM J.	674.15	MCGINN, KELLY A.	1,585.98
WELLER, LINDA JO	1,620.71	DOAN, GERARD P.	1,720.06
GOLDING, JOYCE M.	1,059.15	SHRIFT, PETER R.	1,136.19
DEROSIA, PATRICIA E.	938.33	SCHLAPPI, JAMES L.	1,040.63
DOYLE, ANNE E.	1,385.05	UMULIS, MATTHEW T.	1,172.31
LOY, EVELYN R.	1,017.73	HANKINS, SCOTT A.	1,489.79
KLOOSTER, ALIDA K.	1,675.15	ORBAN, BARBARA K.	1,169.15

TRAEGER, JASON A.	1,295.40	SABSOOK, SARA E.	437.61
WARNER, JANINE M.	1,079.60	BROSIO, VALERIE L.	634.09
EVANS JR, HALBERT K.	1,442.49	RUDOLPH, TRISTAN M.	59.16
GODDARD, RYAN D.	944.45	WEBB, MICHAEL B.	242.43
JOHNSON, KYLE W.	662.59	PARKER-DROST, HERO	461.28
BINGHAM, LARRY E.	820.38	HOLECHECK, JENNACA R.	537.42
VANLOO, JORDAN C.	630.43	ROCKAFELLOW, SARAH C.	567.03
TELGENHOF, WILL G.	528.09	HEID, THOMAS J	1,252.44
GREYERBIEHL, KELLY M.	557.33	STEIN, DONNA E.	204.23
ROLOFF, ROBERT P.	2,269.96	BOOTHE, STEVEN A.	269.95
BRODIN, WILLIAM C.	3,417.70	GRUNCH, RONALD J.	396.82
RILEY, DENISE M.	467.76	RYPSTRA III, BART	281.58
TEUNIS, STEVEN L.	1,681.68	DAVIS, RONALD L.	220.22
WURST, RANDALL W.	1,343.62	MACLEOD, SAMUEL R.	416.38
MAYER, SHELLEY L.	1,475.12	DAKROUB, JOSEPH E.	162.88
HILLING, NICHOLAS A.	1,471.64	MASSON, DONALD J.	176.91
MEIER III, CHARLES A.	1,981.84	MYER, ELIZABETH A.	1,850.80
ZACHARIAS, STEVEN B.	1,288.83	VANLOO, JOSEPH G.	952.92
NISWANDER, JOSEPH F.	1,283.76	WYMAN, MATTHEW A.	1,011.83
EATON, BRAD A.	1,979.58	SCHRADER, LOU ANN	660.27
WILSON, TIMOTHY J.	2,154.83	SCHWAGER, EDWARD J.	503.44
LAVOIE, RICHARD L.	1,924.67	BOSS, RYDER S.	503.65
STEVENS, BRANDON C.	1,650.68	JONES, LARRY M.	87.14
DRAVES, MARTIN J.	1,547.85	TRAVERS, MANUEL J.	138.52
BROWN, STEPHANIE C.	1,023.65	RILEY, DANIEL A.	132.14
ELLIOTT, PATRICK M.	1,762.40	COLE, SHANE	604.89
SCHWARTZFISHER, JOSEPH L.	1,065.82	KLOOSTER, PATRICK H.	682.84
WELLS JR., DONALD E.	1,587.00	LABELLE, DAVIS B.	165.12
BRADLEY, KELLY R.	1,370.91	KLINGER, LUCAS D.	514.61
WILSON, RICHARD J.	1,177.64	GREENE, GLORIA C.	528.09
HART II, DELBERT W.	821.40	KLINGER, BRADLEY W.	208.00
JONES, ROBERT F.	1,327.31	DAVIS, LEAH R.	528.09
DORAN, JUSTIN J.	1,838.33	SWEM, DONALD L.	1,808.24
MANKER JR, DAVID W.	493.95	WHITLEY, ANDREW T.	1,483.38
MANKER SR, DAVID W.	717.35	MORRISON, KEVIN P.	1,137.33
NEUMANN, DANA L.	542.71	HODGE, MICHAEL J.	1,270.61
BECKER, MICHAEL S.	609.65	JOHNSON, STEVEN P.	997.86
SHEPARD, ZACHARY N.	551.87	BISHAW, JAMES H.	737.86
BUTLER, SEAN C.	645.43	HERRIMAN, COBY M.	521.87
HAWKINS, JAMES S.	507.33	HINDLE, LYDIA R.	468.92
MCGHEE, ROBERT R.	1,074.06	MACGILLIVRAY, RAYMOND L.	652.72
STANTS, JACOB W.	531.94	HALL, CHASE D.	676.84
BLOOMER, GABRIELLE J.	570.97	PETERS, MEGAN M.	586.57
MCCLANATHAN, BRANDON R.	263.45	CURTIS, DENNIS E.	1,307.86
STEBE, LAURA A.	105.38	GILL, DAVID R.	1,484.51
FORRESTER, KATHERINE A.	425.27	TODD, RICHARD D.	517.36
AMSTUTZ, LINDA J.	991.91	STEVENS, JEFFREY W.	138.52
DUTCHER, ROBERT G.	273.10	TOTAL	109,905.80

PAYROLL: TRANSMITTAL – 07/02/2015

4FRONT CREDIT UNION	218.46	COMMUNICATION WORKERS OF AMER	497.30
AMERICAN FAMILY LIFE	145.20	MI STATE DISBURSEMENT UNIT	401.83
AMERICAN FAMILY LIFE	271.20	POLICE OFFICERS LABOR COUNCIL	294.00
CHAR EM UNITED WAY	32.00	PRIORITY HEALTH	1,656.80
CHARLEVOIX STATE BANK	1,021.16		
CHEMICAL BANK	150.00	TOTAL	4,687.95